

# State Workforce Development Board Meeting

Thursday, December 5, 2019

9:00 a.m.

Associated Builders and Contractors, Inc.

2821 Broadway Blvd. NE

Albuquerque, NM 87107

---

**Meeting called to order:** (9:03 a.m.) Tracey Bryan, Board Chair

**Roll Call:** Roll was called and quorum was met.

**Attendees:**

Tracey Bryan, Chair Board  
Secretary Bill McCamely, NMDWS  
Bob Grassberger  
Carla Kugler  
Secretary Greg Trapp, Comission for the Blind  
Carlos M. Romero  
Ezra Spitzer  
Bobby Ehrig  
Debra "DJ" Heckes (via teleconference)  
Deborah L. Moore (via teleconference)

Deputy Secretary Yolanda Montoya-Cordova, NMDWS  
Senator Michael Padilla (arrived @ 9:10 am)  
Representative Antonio Maestas  
Dale Dekker  
Patrick Gannon (for Secretary Alicia Keyes)  
Joanna M. Anaya  
Daniel Schlegel (for Gov. Michelle Lujan Grisham)  
Benjamin Woods (via teleconference)  
Johannius Chemweno (via teleconference)  
Deputy Secretary Angela Medrano (for Secretary Dr. David Scrase) (via teleconference)

**Absent:**

Bryn Davis  
Dale Armstrong  
John Rockwell  
Rene Lowden  
Richard Meyer

Mark Fidel  
Rick Davis  
Nancy N. Sauer  
Vince Alvarado  
Deputy Secretary Gwen Perea-Warniment (for Secretary Ryan Stewart)

## **Minutes**

---

**Welcome, Introductions, and Opening Remarks (Agenda Item I):** Tracey Bryan

New Board Members were introduced to board and welcomed. New board members are: Benjamin Woods, Deborah Moore, Nancy Sauer, Joanna Anaya, Carlos Romero, Johonnius Chemweno, Ezra Spitzer and Bobby Ehrig.

---

**Agenda Item II:** Motion to amend agenda; change presentation order. Item VII will be moved to item V, item V will be moved to item VI and item VI will be moved to item VII.

Motion to approve amended agenda: Dale Dekker

2<sup>nd</sup> the Motion – Bob Grassberger

Vote: For – Unanimous approval                      Opposed – None

**Amended agenda was approved**

---

**Agenda Item III:** Motion to approve State Workforce Development Board Meeting minutes from May 8, 2019.

1. Motion to amend May 8, 2019 minutes by: Secretary Greg Trapp.

- Agenda Item II: Motion to approve agenda. Motion by: Dale Dekker Second by: Debra “DJ” Heckes Discussion: No opposition.

Correction: To comply with the OMA provisions on minutes, the minutes should note that a vote was taken and that the agenda was approved unanimously. Saying there was no opposition does not necessarily mean that the agenda was actually voted on and approved. If there are members who abstain, the name of the persons abstaining should be noted. Part of the purpose of the OMA is for the public to see how the members vote, so capturing that a vote has taken place is important.

- Agenda Item III: Motion to approve State Workforce Development Board Meeting minutes from November 14, 2018. Motion by: Bryn Davis Second by: Debra “DJ” Heckes Discussion: No opposition.

Correction: The minutes should also note that a vote was taken and that the minutes were approved unanimously.

- Agenda Item IV: Review attendance requirements.  
Discussion:
  - The question was brought forward regarding whether to allow proxies to attend in place of board members.
  - Next question was whether telephonic attendance was sufficient.
  - Secretary Trapp brought up the fact that the Open Meetings Act states that telephonic attendance is allowed.
  - Conclusions:
  - Members concluded that it would be okay to have designees, rather than proxies to attend meetings. Designees would have to have optimal policy decision making authority for the agency/organization they represent. Designees currently include Deputy Secretaries from HSD and HED
  - Members voted to allow telephonic attendance – there was no opposition.
  - Members voted to add a contingency to telephonic attendance: board members (or their designees) must physically attend 50% of meetings – there was no opposition to this contingency.

Correction: Director Trapp would like his comments to more accurately reflect what he stated, "Director Trapp said that the Open Meetings Act allows for telephonic attendance, if the board has adopted a rule allowing for participation by telephone."

- Agenda Item: Establishing an Executive Committee. Meet every other month (on alternate months to Board meetings).  
Members of the executive committee were identified: Bob Grassberger (Vice chair), Debra "DJ" Heckes (Chair elect), Tracey Bryan.

Conclusions:

Motion to establish executive committee.

Moved by: Carmen Lopez

Second by: Bryn Davis

No opposition.

Correction: It should indicate that a vote was taken; with no opposition.

Motion to approve amended minutes of May 8, 2019: Secretary Bill McCamely

2<sup>nd</sup> the Motion: Debra Heckes

Vote: For – Unanimous approval      Opposed – None

**Amended Minutes for May 8, 2019 was approved**

2. Board Chair Tracey Bryan recommended a change to July 17, 2019 minutes:
  - Agenda Item VI: Board Chair referenced a statement in the discussions regarding Workforce Centers located in Community Colleges, "... and often schools don't want the unemployed coming on campus"; Chair the statement was not reflected correctly. She would like to amend the statement, "... the unemployed coming on campus could be a concern".
  - No comments were mentioned on this change
3. Motion to Approve State Workforce Development Board minutes from May 8, 2019, July 17, 2019 and October 23, 2019.
  - Discussion by Secretary Greg Trapp: Recommendation to approve the minutes of May 8, 2019 meeting; approve July 17, 2019 and October 23, 2019 minutes as a meeting of committee, and not as a board. Due to the board not having a quorum on July 17<sup>th</sup> and October 23<sup>rd</sup>, the board could be in violation of the Open Meetings Act, if minutes were approved as board minutes. Board minutes must be approved at the next board meeting approving minutes from these dates (December 5, 2019).
4. Amended motion to approve minutes of May 8, 2019 as minutes of the Board; July 17, 2019 and October 23, 2019 as minutes of the committee

Motion to approve amended minutes of committee of July 17, 2019 and October 23, 2019 by: Secretary McCamely

2<sup>nd</sup> the Motion: Debra Heckes

Voted: For – Unanimous approval      Opposed – None

**July 17, 2019 and October 23, 2019 minutes of committee were approved**

---

**Agenda Item IV: Approval of State Workforce Board Bylaws & re-affirm commitment to Open Meetings Resolution**

1. Review of the changes made to the Bylaws of the State Workforce Development Board. The discussed changes made to the bylaws were summarized by the Board Chair to members. The amended Bylaws are included in December 5, 2019 board meeting packet for new board members to review.

Motion to approve modified By-Laws by: Senator Padilla

2<sup>nd</sup> the Motion: Carla Kugler

Voted: For – Unanimous approval      Opposed – None

**Board Bylaws were approved as amended.**

2. Review and annual approval of Board's current Open Meeting Resolution as required.

Motion to approve Open Meeting Resolution by: Secretary McCamely

2<sup>nd</sup> the Motion: Secretary Trapp

Voted: For – Unanimous Approval      Opposed - None

**Amended Bylaws and Current Open Meeting Resolution were approved**

---

**Agenda Item V: WIOA Board Structure Presentation**

**Presenter:** Secretary Bill McCamley,  
NMDWS

Secretary McCamley gave presentation on WIOA Infrastructure. The presentation provided an overview of WIOA, compared and contrasted analysis review of unemployment rates in New Mexico and adjoining states, current structure of State and Local Workforce Developments Boards, and effectiveness of serving New Mexico's WIOA customers.

A description was given of the State and Locals Workforce Development Boards, as currently organized. The presentation provided possible contributing factors to why the local workforce boards might struggle;

- High amount of bureaucracy
- Low CEO engagement
- Transactional businesses engagement
- Disproportionate geographic representation on boards
- Lack of competition for service delivery contracts for adult, dislocated worker and youth programs.
- Disparities in levels of collaboration among partners/contractors
- Low monetary spending

The presentation correlated unemployment rates in counties of adjoining states (Arizona, Colorado, Texas and Utah) with unemployment rates of similar demographics of New Mexico counties, illustrating differences and comparisons of states with alternative Workforce Development Board structures. Additionally, various examples of Workforce Developments Board structures in adjoining states were highlighted, encouraging the State Board to examine New Mexico's current structure, then analyze and propose solutions and recommendations to the Governor.

#### **Discussion:**

- Secretary McCamley asked that the State Workforce Development Board evaluate the current structure of the Local Workforce Development Boards to effectively improve or enhance workforce outcomes in communities, support business relationships, provide employment to the residents in the region; with an overarching goal to reducing New Mexico's unemployment rate.
- Board Chair Bryan suggested, and the Board supported the development of, a sub-committee to evaluate the Workforce Development Board structure; report their findings of the evaluation and propose recommendations and suggestions for the full board to review and consider.
- The Workforce Development Board sub-committee members will include: Daniel Schlegel (Committee Chair), Senator Michael Padilla, Deborah Moore, Benjamin Woods, Ezra Spitzer, Carla Kugler and Carlos Romero.
- Due to Federal requirement to include Chief Elected Officials, Secretary McCamley proposed a discussion with Steve Colberman of NM Assoc. of Counties from the Municipal League, to appoint a person from the association and league to be involved in the sub-committee.

#### **Action Items**

- Sub-committee to evaluate the board structure; Present opportunities and recommendations
- Inquire on appointees from NM Assoc. of Counties & Municipal League for sub-committee

#### **Responsible Party**

Daniel Schlegel (Committee Chair)

Secretary Bill McCamley

**Agenda Items VI:** Understanding Return on Investment and how this could be applied to our Workforce Programs

**Presenter:** Bob Grassberger, Vice Chair

Mr. Grassberger's presentation included information about:

- 1) Models of board structures currently being utilized that includes sub-committees focusing on sector strategies. Noting the importance of this structure to fully understanding impact to businesses. He noted a priority should be given to the impact to local business as a cornerstone activity for workforce outcomes.
- 2) He noted that Governor Lujan-Grisham provided a list of ten (10) sector strategies of focus and believes these should drive the Boards plan and focus;
- 2) Referenced a Federal Government resource, called Workforce GPS, to view on-line seminars to provide assistance. Encouraged all Board members to become familiar with the link, review some of the webinars and to utilize the tool to help them become more familiar with the requirements of workforce development.

Mr. Grassberger recapped the presentation made by Joyce Wilson at the October 2019 meeting. He summarized nine (9) different programs and the Return of Investment (ROI) of each program, and believes

this evaluation can be used to determine which programs can be beneficial to New Mexico. Using an ROI model can challenge the State Board, in regard to performance, on three factors: are the programs effective, efficient, and innovative.

Three (3) perspectives that need to be analyzed:

- 1) Job seekers-Did we create more jobs and more income? What needs to be asked, “What are the quality of these jobs? How sustainable are the jobs being created? Is there a long-term pathway to success?
- 2) Businesses – How are we serving businesses? Are businesses getting the employees they are seeking? Are employees being retained? Is there a long term relationship?
- 3) Taxpayer perspective – the ROI aspect of investing State and Federal dollars and the return of investment of those dollars? What is the return for every dollar we spend?

When evaluating ROI studies on a traditional outlook, a negative return would indicate not to invest in that particular project (program). However, when the discussion involves WIOA programs, the traditional outlook may not be the best evaluation. When analyzing the nine programs from the Texas Workforce Development Board, the ROI outlook may have indicated not to invest in said program based on the ROI to the audience. A different approaches may be needed to measure programs. Using the federal measures alone is insufficient.

An emphasis of the presentation was that New Mexico currently has access to great data! We can also develop an ROI model that addresses unique aspects of New Mexico. The modified ROI models can help drive better decisions with program success and provider performance. The development of metrics are timely and costly but we should invest. Ultimately, we want to obtain the largest impact on WIOA dollars invested.

#### **Discussion:**

- Does NMDWS have enough data currently available, without having to purchase additional data to analyze to make these decisions? There is a concern about the amount of data that is required by USDOL to measure performance of Local Workforce Boards and providers which at times could be a burden to the effectiveness of the programs. The answer to this concern is creating a viable strategy to address what we should be reviewing. Another concern is the lack of collecting meaningful metrics on the business side – what do we know about our relationship with businesses? How do we measure this outcome

---

**Agenda Item VII:** Labor Market trends

**Presenter:** Rachel Moskowitz, Director  
Economic Research and Analysis

Presentation of Labor Market Information for New Mexico. The presentation illustrated a comparison of New Mexico v. United States on various labor force rates, labor force participation, and unemployment rates in different demographics. The presentation was informational and highlighted how unemployment is collected/reported. Ms. Moskowitz provided clarifying information about how the data can and cannot be utilized and the importance of using the information for planning and forecasting – especially for potential recession. Noted New Mexico did not ever fully recover from the last great recessions. Unemployment rates continue to be higher than other states. Also noted an over reliance on oil and gas industry.

Discussion:

- Board members asked clarifying questions about how data is calculated. Discussed relevance of information for planning purposes.

---

**Agenda Item VIII:** State Plan Revision Plan

**Presenter:** Yolanda Montoya-Cordova, Deputy Secretary, NMDWS

Deputy Secretary Montoya-Cordova provided a brief explanation of the four (4) year state plan, the partners included in the plan, and the process involved in the development of the plan. Reminded board members of the two town hall public forums planned for late February at the Convention Centers in both Albuquerque and Las Cruces in February 2020.

Announced the adjusted deadline/schedule from USDOL to March 2, 2020. The next partners meeting will be focused developing vision, goals and shared metrics across all agencies/partners. The next State Board meeting scheduled for February 6, 2020 will be a combined workforce meeting with the State Rehabilitation Councils (Commission for the Blind & DVR), to present a DRAFT proposed goals and activities. Board and Council members will be able to provide feedback and input during the meeting.

Board members were informed of the importance of their attendance to the public forums. Registration to the Albuquerque and Las Cruces forums will open soon. The forums will be facilitated in partnership with NM First, an entity hired by NMDWS to assist with the overall development of the plan. Additionally, Youth Public Forums are scheduled on the same dates and locations. The Youth forums will be designed by the State Youth Engagement Coordinator in an effort to solicit youth input. State Plan will be sent to State Board Members at the conclusion of the forum with incorporated modifications, for board approval.

---

**Agenda Item IX:** Other Business / Announcements / Board Closing Comments

- Joseph Weather, Board Chair for Northern Area Workforce Development Board, recognized and thanked Deputy Secretary Montoya-Cordova and the WIOA team for the guidance and technical assistance given to the Northern Board
- Secretary Trapp announced the Governor's Rapid Hiring Event for State employment. It is a four-day event starting Wednesday, December 11, 2019, that will focus on filling vacant positions with various departments with NM State government agencies. The event will occur at Expo New Mexico, located on the NM State Fairgrounds.
- Board Chair Bryan requested that information for the Rapid Hire event and State Plan Public Forums be sent out to all board members.

---

**Meeting Adjournment at 11:24 a.m.**